Location The Sternberg Centre For Judaism The Lodge 80 East End Road

London N3 2SY

Reference: 14/07798/S73 Received: 8th December 2014

Accepted: 8th December 2014

Ward: Finchley Church End Expiry 2nd February 2015

Applicant: Claire Mandel

Variation of condition 18 (Hours of Use) pursuant to planning permission reference F/00690/08 dated 24/07/2008 for 'Erection of synagogue (Variation of planning permission C00403CL/05 dated 30-09-2005 for demolition of existing Akiva School, link block, caretakers house and all timber-framed and prefabricated outbuildings, and erection of new Akiva School block adjacent Windermere Avenue and

erection of new Akiva School block adjacent Windermere Avenue a Pavillion Mews, new synagogue adjacent St. Theresa's Primary

Proposal: School and extension and alterations to existing stable block/Biet

Limmud building including meeting/conference rooms, associated offices and canteen, together with associated changes to landscaping, provision of 50 car-parking spaces, single storey refuse store and alterations to Manor House). Variations to include relaxation of

restricted hours of use to allow extension of opening hours of premises between 8.00am and Midnight Fridays and Saturdays and between

7.30am and Midnight on all other days

Recommendation: Approve subject to s106

RECOMMENDATION I:

That the applicant and any other person having a requisite interest be invited to enter by way of an agreement into a planning obligation under Section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 and any other legislation which is considered necessary for the purposes seeking to secure the following:

- 1. Paying the council's legal and professional costs of preparing the Agreement and any other enabling agreements;
- 2. All obligations listed below to become enforceable in accordance with a timetable to be agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority;
- 3. To delegate the authority to officers to carry out a comprehensive review of all of the Heads of Terms associated with the Section 106 legal agreement related to the planning permission C00403CL/05 (granted 30.09.2005) and subsequent Deed of Variation in relation to F/00690/08 and then prepare a Section 106 legal agreement accordingly.

RECOMMENDATION II:

That upon completion of the agreement the Planning Performance and Business Development Manager approve the planning application under delegated powers subject to the following conditions:

1 This development must be begun within three years from the date of this permission.

Reason: To comply with Section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans:

Access Statement, Design Statement, Extended Phase 1 Habitat Survey of Land at the Sternberg Centre reference CAPPRO-STECEN-1168, Visualisations, Ecological Stategy meeting minutes, Tree felling approvals, Arboricultural Survey / Arboricultural Impact Assessment / Method Statement reference AR/1233/06, Ambient noise survey AAc/112563/R01-sj, Supporting Planning Statement, Ventilation Report Issue C, N[2-]000 Option B only, U[--]001A/B, U[--]002A/B,U[--]003A/B,U[--]040A/A, T[31]020/B, Arboricultural Survey drawing 155/02/P2, 155/12/P7, 155/500/P6, 155/501/P5, 411-A-100A, 411-L-010, 411-L-011, 411-L-100H, 411-L-105A, 411-L-110J, 411-L-120G, 411-L-200J, 411-L-230G, 411-L-240H, 411-L-250D, 411-L-300F, 411-L-320G, 411-L-315D, 411-L-310F, 411-L-305D, Acoustic Report from Arup Acoustics dated 09/06/08 and numbered 123813/MJW.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of proper planning and so as to ensure that the development is carried out fully in accordance with the plans as assessed in accordance with Policies CS NPPF and CS1 of the Local Plan Core Strategy DPD (adopted September 2012) and Policy DM01 of the Local Plan Development Management Policies DPD (adopted September 2012).

3 The pedestrian access in the boundary wall fronting East End Road and the secondary access in the boundary wall with Pavillion Mews shall only be used for the purpose of the emergency evacuation of the site and shall be used for no other purpose.

Reason: In the interests of safeguarding residential amenity and in compliance with policies DM01, DM02, DM13 and DM17 of the Adopted Local Plan Development Management Policies DPD (2012) and policies CS1, CS NPPF and CS9 of the Local Plan Core Strategy (2012).

Any external lighting, floodlighting or other means of external illumination shall be affixed to the external elevations of the building, or placed/erected within the site without the prior written consent of the local planning authority pursuant to a planning application. Any external lighting, floodlighting or other means of external illumination shall be installed and thereafter retained in full accordance with the

approved details.

Reason: To enable the local planning authority to retain control over these matters in the interests of the amenities of adjoining properties and to safeguard the setting of the adjoining listed building and in compliance with policies DM01, DM02, DM06, DM13 and DM17 of the Adopted Local Plan Development Management Policies DPD (2012) and policies CS1, CS NPPF, CS5 and CS9 of the Local Plan Core Strategy (2012).

Any existing tree shown to be retained or trees or shrubs to be planted as part of the approved landscaping scheme which are removed, die, become severely damaged or diseased within five years of the completion of development shall be replaced with trees or shrubs of appropriate size and species in the next planting season.

Reason: To ensure a satisfactory appearance to the development and in compliance with policies DM01, DM02 of the Adopted Local Plan Development Management Policies DPD (2012) and policies CS1, CS NPPF and CS9 of the Local Plan Core Strategy (2012).

The use of the premises for the purposes hereby permitted (unless otherwise agreed in writing by the local planning authority or as set out in any associated legal agreement under Section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended) shall only take place between the hours of 8.00am and midnight Fridays and Saturdays and between 7.30am and midnight on all other days.

Reason: In the interests of safeguarding residential amenity and in compliance with policies DM01, DM02, DM13 and DM17 of the Adopted Local Plan Development Management Policies DPD (2012) and policies CS1, CS NPPF and CS9 of the Local Plan Core Strategy (2012).

The level of noise emitted from the operation and use of the synagogue hereby approved shall be at least 5dB(A) below the background level, as measured from any point 1 metre outside the window of any room of any neighbouring property which existed at the time of this decision notice. If the noise emitted has a distinguishable, discreet continuous note (whine, hiss, screech, hum) and/or distinct impulse (bangs, clicks, clatters, thumps), then it shall be at least 10dB(A) below the background level, as measured from any point 1 metre outside the window of any room of any existing neighbouring property at the time of this decision notice.

Reason: In the interests of safeguarding residential amenity and in compliance with policies DM01, DM02, DM13 and DM17 of the Adopted Local Plan Development Management Policies DPD (2012) and policies CS1, CS NPPF and CS9 of the Local Plan Core Strategy (2012).

RECOMMENDATION III:

1 Recommendation III

That if the above agreement has not been completed or a unilateral undertaking has not been submitted by 31/05/2017, unless otherwise agreed in writing, the Director of Planning REFUSE the application under delegated powers for the following reason(s):

1. The development fails to provide a legal undertaking to provide for effective management of the activities carried out on the site and for car parking, as well as mitigate against the likely highway impact arising from this development contrary to policies DM01, DM02, DM05, DM13 and DM17 of the Development Management Policies DPD and the Planning Obligations SPD.

Informative(s):

In accordance with paragraphs 186 and 187 of the NPPF, the Local Planning Authority (LPA) takes a positive and proactive approach to development proposals, focused on solutions. The LPA has produced planning policies and written guidance to assist applicants when submitting applications. These are all available on the Council's website. A pre-application advice service is also offered and the Applicant engaged with this prior to the submissions of this application. The LPA has negotiated with the applicant/agent where necessary during the application process to ensure that the proposed development is in accordance with the Development Plan.

Officer's Assessment

1. Site Description

The Sternberg Centre is located on the southwest side of East End Road opposite the junction with Manor View. The Sternberg Centre occupies a site of approximately 3.03hectares and incorporates a mixture of land uses, functions and facilities principally for the Jewish Community.

Beyond the site, the area is predominantly residential, although there is another school adjoining the site along East End Road to the southeast and sports grounds to the opposite side of East End Road. Basing Way housing estate is located to the south of the site.

The site comprises:

- o An 18th Century moated site which is designated as a Scheduled Ancient Monument.
- o An 18th Century three storey Manor House which is designated as a Grade II* Listed Building.
- o A three storey flat roofed extension and link building to the side of the Manor House.
- o A three storey modern building (the Beit Limmud building) and a number of original single storey outbuildings (the stable block).
- o A two storey house on the south east corner of the site that provided accommodation for the caretaker.
- A newly built school.

The site is not located in a conservation area. There are a number of Tree Preservation Orders for the site and there is an area order for the area around the external boundaries of the site along East End Road and along the boundary with the Basing Way Estate.

The Sternberg Centre plays a major role in the life of the Jewish Community. It includes the central facility of Reform Judaism in the UK and accommodates a large number of organisations that inter-act to provide religious and community services to both the local and national Jewish Communities.

The site essentially contains the Head office and community centre of Reform Judaism in the UK and Europe, the Akiva primary school, the New North London Synagogue and Gan Alon Nursery and the Leo Baeck College and Centre for Jewish Education. The Sternberg Centre was established in 1981 after the Manor House and its grounds were collectively purchased by a number of Jewish organisations. Together they formed the Manor House Trust, which administers the site.

2. Site History (selected)

Reference: F/00008/11

Address: The Sternberg Centre For Judaism, 80 East End Road, London, N3 2SY

Decision: Approved subject to conditions

Decision Date: 15 March 2011

Description: Variation of Condition 7 (Cycle Parking) pursuant to planning permission

F/00690/08 dated 24/07/08 to alter location of cycle parking (but not number of

spaces).

Reference: F/04726/10

Address: The Sternberg Centre For Judaism, 80 East End Road, London, N3 2SY

Decision: Approved subject to conditions

Decision Date: 8 February 2011

Description: Use of vacant building (Stables block) as a Jewish Military Museum (Use class D1). Internal alterations including extension to existing Mezzanine (25m²). Alterations to roof including insertion of 4 dormer windows facing courtyard. Replacement of all

windows and doors with new double glazed windows and doors.

Reference: F/00730/08

Address: The Sternberg Centre For Judaism, 80 East End Road, London, N3 2SY

Decision: Approved subject to conditions

Decision Date: 24 July 2008

Description: Erection of synagogue (Variation of Listed Building consent C00403CM/05 dated 30-09-05 for demolition of existing Akiva School, link block, caretakers house and all timber-framed and prefabricated outbuildings, and erection of new Akiva School block adjacent Windermere Avenue and Pavillion Mews, new synagogue adjacent St. Theresa's Primary School and extension and alterations to

existing stable block/Biet Limmud building including meeting/conference rooms, associated offices and canteen, together with associated changes to landscaping. provision of 50 car-parking spaces, single storey refuse store and alterations to Manor House) (LISTED BUILDING CONSENT)

Reference: F/00690/08

Address: The Sternberg Centre For Judaism, 80 East End Road, London, N3 2SY

Decision: Approved following legal agreement

Decision Date: 24 July 2008

Description: Erection of synagogue (Variation of planning permission C00403CL/05 dated 30-09-2005 for demolition of existing Akiva School, link block, caretakers house and all timber-framed and prefabricated outbuildings, and erection of new Akiva School block adjacent Windermere Avenue and Pavillion Mews, new synagogue adjacent St. Theresa's Primary School and extension and alterations to

existing stable block/Biet Limmud building including meeting/conference rooms, associated offices and canteen, together with associated changes to landscaping, provision of 50 car-parking spaces, single storey refuse store and alterations to Manor House).

Reference: C00403CL/05

Address: The Sternberg Centre For Judaism, 80 East End Road, London, N3 2SY

Decision: Approved following legal agreement

Decision Date: 30 September 2005

Description: Demolition of existing Akiva School, link block, caretakers house and all timber-framed and prefabricated outbuildings, and erection of new Akiva School block adjacent Windermere Avenue and Pavillion Mews, new synagogue adjacent St. Theresa's Primary School and extension and alterations to existing stable block/Biet Limmud building including meeting/conference rooms, associated offices and canteen, together with associated changes to landscaping, provision of 50 car-parking spaces, single storey refuse store and alterations to Manor House.

Reference: C00403CG/04

Address: The Sternberg Centre For Judaism, 80 East End Road, London, N3 2SY

Decision: Refused

Decision Date: 29 July 2004

Description: Demolition of existing Akiva School, link block, caretakers house and all timber-framed and prefabricated outbuildings, and erection of new partially submerged Akiva School block adjacent Windermere Avenue, new synagogue adjacent St. Theresas Primary School and extension of existing stable block/Biet Limmud including an auditorium partially positioned below ground level, together with

associated changes to landscaping, car-parking and alterations to Manor House.

3. Proposal

Permission is sought for the variation of condition 18 (hours of use) of planning permission F/00690/08. That application sought planning permission for the Erection of synagogue (Variation of planning permission C00403CL/05 dated 30-09-2005 for demolition of existing Akiva School, link block, caretakers house and all timber-framed and prefabricated outbuildings, and erection of new Akiva School block adjacent Windermere Avenue and Pavillion Mews, new synagogue adjacent St. Theresa's Primary School and extension and alterations to existing stable block/Biet Limmud building including meeting/conference rooms, associated offices and canteen, together with associated changes to landscaping, provision of 50 car-parking spaces, single storey refuse store and alterations to Manor House).

Condition 18 of the planning permission stated the following:

The use of the premises for the purposes hereby permitted (unless otherwise agreed in writing by the local planning authority or as set out in any associated legal agreement under Section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended) shall only take place between the hours of 8.00am and 10.30pm Fridays and Saturdays and between 7.30am and 10.30pm on all other days.

Reason: In the interests of the amenity of occupiers of neighbouring residential properties.

The application proposes the variation of the condition to achieve the following:

The use of the premises for the purposes hereby permitted (unless otherwise agreed in writing by the local planning authority or as set out in any associated legal agreement under Section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended) shall only take place between the hours of 8.00am and midnight Fridays and Saturdays and between 7.30am and midnight on all other days.

Reason: In the interests of the amenity of occupiers of neighbouring residential properties.

4. Public Consultation

Consultation letters were sent to 140 neighbouring properties. 13 responses have been received, comprising 13 letters of objection.

The objections received can be summarised as follows:

- The existing hours were in place to minimise disruption.
- However, despite that, there are noisy activities taking place and parking pressures.
- The Activities Management Plan (AMP) allows for a relaxation of the controls on certain days. Because of this, other restrictions should not be relaxed.

- There is anti social behaviour which occurs, generally when people are returning home including banging of car doors, people talking, headlights.
- There is insufficient car parking in the area to accommodate the demand from this site.

5. Planning Considerations

5.1 Policy Context

National Planning Policy Framework and National Planning Practice Guidance

The determination of planning applications is made mindful of Central Government advice and the Local Plan for the area. It is recognised that Local Planning Authorities must determine applications in accordance with the statutory Development Plan, unless material considerations indicate otherwise, and that the planning system does not exist to protect the private interests of one person against another.

The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) was published on 27 March 2012. This is a key part of the Governments reforms to make the planning system less complex and more accessible, and to promote sustainable growth.

The NPPF states that 'good design is a key aspect of sustainable development, is indivisible from good planning, and should contribute positively to making places better for people'. The NPPF retains a presumption in favour of sustainable development. This applies unless any adverse impacts of a development would 'significantly and demonstrably' outweigh the benefits.

The Mayor's London Plan 2015

The London Development Plan is the overall strategic plan for London, and it sets out a fully integrated economic, environmental, transport and social framework for the development of the capital to 2031. It forms part of the development plan for Greater London and is recognised in the NPPF as part of the development plan.

The London Plan provides a unified framework for strategies that are designed to ensure that all Londoners benefit from sustainable improvements to their quality of life.

Barnet's Local Plan (2012)

Barnet's Local Plan is made up of a suite of documents including the Core Strategy and Development Management Policies Development Plan Documents. Both were adopted in September 2012.

- Relevant Core Strategy Policies: CS NPPF, CS1, CS5, CS9 and CS10
- Relevant Development Management Policies: DM01, DM02, DM04, DM13 and DM17

Supplementary Planning Documents

Sustainable Design and Construction SPD (adopted April 2013)

- Provides detailed guidance that supplements policies in the adopted Local Plan, and sets out how sustainable development will be delivered in Barnet.

5.2 Main issues for consideration

The main issues for consideration in this case are:

- Whether harm would be caused to the living conditions of neighbouring residents.
- Whether the local highway network would be able to accommodate any additional parking demand arising from the proposed extension to the hours of use.
- The implications for the development on the existing Section 106 agreement and its future implementation.

5.3 Assessment of proposals

Permission is sought for the variation of condition 18 (hours of use) of the synagogue building which was permitted under planning application permission F/00690/08. That application was a variation of an earlier planning permission in 2005 for the erection of a new school and synagogue. This variation seeks permission for the synagogue to be able to be used until midnight on any given day. The planning application F/00690/08 was granted on 24 July 2008 and was completed in 2011. This would be in addition to the relaxation of hours of use controls permitted for holy days, holidays and religious festivals in written agreement with the Council. These days are defined by the Section 106 agreement as being Pesach (four days), Shavuot (2 days), Succoth (3 days), Yom Kippur (1 day), Rosh Hashanah (2 days), Chanukah (1 day), Purim (1 day) and Simchat Tora (1 day).

The planning application F/00690/08 was submitted to the Council to deal specifically with sound insulation and acoustic impact details that lead to design changes requiring a further application to be submitted. Although the option of non -material minor amendments was considered, officers were of the view that these alterations to the design and the possible amenity implications were material and as such, an application for a variation of the previous planning permission was made.

The applicant is the New North London Synagogue and they have advised that since the building has been occupied, the premises have been used as a valuable community resource not just for the membership but also for the wider community in the area. The facilities allow for the site to accommodate life cycle and rites of passage events such as Bar Mitzvahs and wedding celebrations. However, there have only been 8 Bar Mitzvahs in the period between 2011 - 2014. The applicants have taken particular steps to ensure that no disturbance takes place to neighbours, including the closure of any openings, sound level limitation and servicing and disposal on the day after.

However the 22.30 finish has meant that there is reluctance from the community to holding such events at the Sternberg Centre. Nevertheless, the applicants do not expect that such parties and events would take place on a regular basis and just 8 events are expected to occur per year. Nevertheless, it is considered that the existing operational activities would be able to occur satisfactorily within the existing hours set out within Condition 18 of the 2008 planning permission.

The condition was imposed on the planning permission to protect the amenity of occupiers of the neighbouring residential properties. Any impacts can manifest themselves in two way, firstly through the noise impacts arising from the actual use whether that may include amplified noise and sound and the or from the movements and activities of people dispersing from the premises after the conclusion of the use of the synagogue as approved.

Environmental Health officers were consulted on the planning application and provided a written response to officers. They advised that no written complaints were made relating to the New North London Synagogue's use of the site since the synagogue was constructed and occupied in 2011.

Nevertheless, the potential for the site to be used until later in the evening and for events requiring amplified noise and sound will require some safeguards including confirmation that windows and openings will be closed at times when amplified sound is not broadcast

but when there may be high attendance. In addition, the sound limiter should ensure that noise events are at least 5dB(A) below the background noise level as measured from any point 1 metre outside the window of any room of neighbouring residential properties.

The original hours of use condition was considered acceptable and reasonable in providing a balance between the needs of the users and the function of the site along with the amenity considerations of neighbours. A number of objectors have raised concerns about people returning to cars parked around local streets, turning on headlights, closing car doors, talking loudly in a peaceful residential environment. The environmental health officer has not received any specific complaints in relation to the use of the synagogue in connection with these actions. However the application proposes that there would be approximately a dozen additional later evening events per year in relation to the synagogue which are considered would only have a minor impact on residential amenity over and above that which might occur as a result of the use.

The Section 106 agreement secures the implementation and adherence to an Activities Management Plan (AMP) to ensure that the Council retains oversight of the activities, times and population on the site at any one time. The AMP sets out requirements which include the details of the estimated number of parking spaces, sound attenuation measures and management and stewarding of attendees to mitigate against any adverse impact on the locality. The AMP also obliges the applicants to provide CCTV pictures and records of events and numbers of attendees to the Council on request. The AMP also requires the applicants to direct their attendees to be considerate to neighbours after 22.00 and to have a named person for responding to complaints.

These arrangements will be secured again within a revised Section 106 legal agreement that will be completed alongside the granting of permission for the variation of condition 18.

The proposal does not give rise to any additional floorspace and the AMP will still impose restrictions on the numbers of attendees on the site and in conjunction with a Car Parking Management Plan that is also secured through the Section 106 legal agreement, it is considered that the proposed variation of the condition would not give rise to any additional parking. Highways officers have been notified of this application and have raised no objections to this application.

In varying the condition, the Council has had regard to the requirements of the NPPF and the NPPG to ensure that the condition passes the tests set out therein and is an appropriate method to address the obvious impacts that would arise from the development. The extension of the hours to midnight would be acceptable and would not give rise to an unacceptable level of harm given all the safeguards that exist. It is noted that condition 26 of the decision notice states that the noise from the air handling unit, chiller, shul exhaust fans, kitchen extract fans and the ground source heat pump shall be at least 5dB(A) below the background noise level as measured from any point 1 metre outside the windows of any room of a neighbouring property.

Given the questions raised by the environmental health officer about amplified noise and sound and the applicants willingness to use sound monitors and limiters, it would be appropriate to also ensure that this condition is amended to include all noise the premises.

As such, former Condition 18 (now condition 6) should be amended as follows:

The use of the premises for the purposes hereby permitted (unless otherwise agreed in writing by the local planning authority or as set out in any associated legal agreement under Section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended) shall only take place between the hours of 8.00am and midnight Fridays and Saturdays and between 7.30am and midnight on all other days.

Reason: In the interests of the amenity of occupiers of neighbouring residential properties and in compliance with policies DM01, DM02, DM13 and DM17 of the Adopted Local Plan Development Management Policies DPD (2012) and policies CS1, CS NPPF and CS9 of the Local Plan Core Strategy (2012).

And, former Condition 26 (now Condition 7) should be amended as follows:

The level of noise emitted from the operation and use of the synagogue hereby approved shall be at least 5dB(A) below the background level, as measured from any point 1 metre outside the window of any room of any neighbouring property which existed at the time of this decision notice. If the noise emitted has a distinguishable, discrete continuous note (whine, hiss, screech, hum) and/or distinct impulse (bangs, clicks, clatters, thumps), then it shall be at least 10dB(A) below the background level, as measured from any point 1 metre outside the window of any room of any existing neighbouring property at the time of this decision notice.

Reason To ensure that the proposed development does not prejudice the amenities of occupiers of neighbouring properties and in compliance with policies DM01, DM02, DM13 and DM17 of the Adopted Local Plan Development Management Policies DPD (2012) and policies CS1, CS NPPF and CS9 of the Local Plan Core Strategy (2012).

As already stated, given the mixture of different uses and occupiers within the Sternberg Centre as outlined at the head of this report and to limit the impact of the proposed development on the residential amenity of neighbouring properties, a Section 106 agreement has been in place since 2005 subsequently varied by the 2008 application. This has consisted of four key elements: (A) Site development and phasing plan (B) Activities Management Plan (C) Car Parking Management Plan (CPMP) and (D) a highways contribution

There is still clearly a necessity for the Activities Management Plan and the Car Parking Management Plan to be implemented and adhered to for this site. The site development phasing plan has not been implemented in the agreed manner since the completion of the legal agreement in 2005 and as such this will need to be reviewed to ensure that further development takes place in a coherent manner that allows for the preservation of amenity, for the preservation of the existing listed building and to ensure that the impacts of uses can be satisfactorily controlled. In addition, a highways contribution remains outstanding and further negotiation must be undertaken to ensure that the Council can still reasonably secure this money to assist with the mitigation of any impact that this development might generate.

As such, it is considered that the recommendation associated with this application to vary condition 18 should be accompanied by a wholly new legal agreement that seeks to take forward the same terms of the previous legal agreement including the AMP and CPMP. However, given the applicant's failures to adhere appropriately to the terms of the legal agreement, it is not possible to set out a complete heads of terms at this stage. Members are being requested to agree to delegate authority to officers to discuss appropriate heads

of terms for a new legal agreement ahead of permission for the variation of the condition under Section 73 of the Town and Country Planning Act (1990) is issued.

5.4 Response to Public Consultation

The objections raised have been considered in the report above.

6. Equality and Diversity Issues

The proposal does not conflict with either Barnet Council's Equalities Policy or the commitments set in the Equality Scheme and supports the Council in meeting its statutory equality responsibilities.

7. Conclusion

Having taken all material considerations into account, it is considered that subject to compliance with all other relevant attached conditions, the variation of the hours of use condition is not considered to have an adverse impact on the amenities of neighbouring occupiers. This application is therefore recommended for approval.

